

February 23, 2012

THAT the meeting was called to order by Commissioner Crane at 9:30 A.M. in the Board Room of the Livingston County Road Commission, 3535 Grand Oaks Drive, Howell, Michigan. Notice of the meeting was posted in accordance with Act #267 of 1976.

A. CALL TO ORDER

B. PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

C. ROLL CALL

Commissioners Present: Stephen F. Crane
John T. Dunleavy
David R. Peckens

Staff Present: Tom Barron, Engineering Technician
Michael Craine, Managing Director
Terry Palmer, Accounting Supervisor
Jodie Tedesco, County Highway Engineer
Steve Wasyk, Deputy Managing Director of Operations

Others Present: Chris Behnan, Daily Press and Argus
Tom Darling, WHMI
Dan Laforge, ALTA Equipment Co.
Mark Moran, Michigan Caterpillar
Chris Robinson, AIS/JDE Equipment

D. APPROVAL OF AGENDA

ACTION: It was moved by Commissioner Dunleavy, seconded by Commissioner Peckens, to approve the agenda as presented.

Ayes: Commissioners Crane, Dunleavy, Peckens.

Nays: None.

Motion Carried.

E. CALL TO THE PUBLIC (1)

No Response

F. ACTION ITEMS

1. Project Agreement, Hartland Township
 - Bergin Road, Hacker Road to Rolling Hills Drive
(Resolution 1202-011)

Hartland Township requested limestone resurfacing of Bergin Road from Hacker Road to Rolling Hills Drive. Tree work and limited drainage work would be performed in conjunction with the resurfacing. Staff submitted an estimate for the project to the township. The township approved the project and staff recommended LCRC Board approval as well.

ACTION: It was moved by Commissioner Dunleavy, seconded by Commissioner Peckens, to approve Resolution 1202-011. (Certified Copy on file in the Board Meeting Resolutions.)

Ayes: Commissioners Crane, Dunleavy, Peckens.

Nays: None.

Motion Carried.

2. Equipment Purchase
• Motor Grader
(Resolution 1202-012)

Mr. Craine indicated that Board members had additional material including supplemental information filed by vendors who wished to do so, and some comparisons that were prepared by Mr. Messner. Mr. Craine informed the Board that the Road Commission had received bids from three vendors for four different machines. As always, the equipment purchase decision was based upon the performance of the machines, the quality of service, the total cost of the equipment, and the performance value of each.

George Messner provided an analysis of the four machines that had been proposed for consideration. He stated that he believed each of the selling dealers had demonstrated high service characteristics for equipment previously purchased by the Road Commission. He said that without exception the dealer network was responsive to Road Commission requests. It is his opinion that the machine selected needs to have the clear ability to translate its power to the ground engaging equipment so that the Road Commission can grade as many miles of road as possible. It is also his belief that recent innovations for machine guidance such as joystick steering were a mixed bag for the Road Commission which has had little opportunity to utilize this guidance system in adverse weather conditions.

He indicated that the two Caterpillar machines utilized the Caterpillar M-Series joystick control. Efforts were made by both the dealer and the Road Commission to obtain a machine for rental this winter in order to determine the handling characteristics in our environment. Unfortunately, no machine could be obtained.

In evaluating the Volvo and John Deere bids, Mr. Messner indicated that the most important difference seems to be with the power of the engine when engine lugging conditions occurred. The displacement of the John Deere motor (548 cubic inches) was considerably greater than the displacement of the Volvo motor (476 cubic inches). George said that in our type of work there is no replacement for displacement. There was a detailed discussion of how torque curve influences grading speed and performance.

Chairman Crane called for comments from the vendors. Dan LaForge from Alta Equipment Co. provided his thoughts on the value of the Volvo motor grader. He stated that Volvo has addressed torque curve and that the new 11-speed transmission addressed concerns about the torque rise of the engine. In his opinion, this provided the necessary response to motor displacement. He felt that the transmission and available horsepower per gear addressed the lugging power issue. He went on to explain the machine warranty and the fact that the buyback agreement was available in each of the five years of the lease.

Chris Robinson of AIS/JDE Equipment indicated that the Deere was established as a leader in effective powertrains. He stated that in test after test, John Deere motors, graders, scrapers, and farm tractors all performed well and had excellent lugging power. He further indicated that there would be a much improved fuel savings over competitors in the operation of the John Deere 772G and in his opinion it offered the best value for the customer.

Mark Moran of Michigan Cat told the Board that Caterpillar has been listening to the concerns expressed by the Road Commission about speed sensitive steering. He stated that they tried very hard to get a machine for the Road Commission to rent this winter and were prepared to pay the cost of bringing it across the country if necessary. Unfortunately, no machine could be located that was available for rent. Mark said that there are approximately 14,000 M-Series machines in place around the world and that 103 had been sold in Michigan. He pointed out to the Board that their bid allowed for the Road Commission to lease the machine for one year for a rental price of \$3,000 per month and turn it back in if it was not satisfactory. He emphasized the commitment of Caterpillars' engineers to the municipal market and of Michigan Cat to us as a customer. Commissioner Peckens asked Mr. Messner if the winter concerns with the Cat machine were directed toward pushing snow or machine travel. Mr. Messner said both were concerns. He said road maintenance agencies tend to travel from work zone to work zone in the motor grader rather than putting it in a lowboy trailer to transport like a contractor does.

Mr. Craine said that staff is recommending acquisition of the John Deere 772G under either the Version 2 or Version 4 option presented by the dealership. The Version 2 option is a traditional financing package at 2.32% with a balloon payment at the end of the fifth year. Version 4 is a modified governmental lease at 7.5% with a purchase option at a fair market value to be

determined. There was detailed discussion by the Board and the consensus that Version 2 best met the needs of the Road Commission.

ACTION: It was moved by Commissioner Peckens, seconded by Commissioner Dunleavy, to approve Resolution 1202-012. (Certified Copy on file in the Board Meeting Resolutions.)

Ayes: Commissioners Crane, Dunleavy, Peckens.

Nays: None.

Motion Carried.

3. Road Dedication
 - Whitehorse Lane/Figurski DriveSection 4, Genoa Township
(Resolution 1202-013)

Mr. Craine gave a brief history of Whitehorse Lane. Since the time of concept approval, the road naming has been bifurcated. The segment from Lawson Drive heading easterly to the east/west segment of Whitehorse Lane has been renamed Figurski Drive. The balance of the roadway from Figurski to Lawson Drive remains Whitehorse Lane. Mr. Craine explained the difficulty of arranging simultaneous closings of twelve parcels. Accordingly, he is recommending the road be accepted once the simultaneous closing can be arranged and all title work is complete.

ACTION: It was moved by Commissioner Peckens, seconded by Commissioner Dunleavy, to approve Resolution 1202-013. (Certified Copy on file in the Board Meeting Resolutions.)

Ayes: Commissioners Crane, Dunleavy, Peckens.

Nays: None.

Motion Carried.

4. Muir Road
 - Section 24, Brighton Township

Steve Wasylyk distributed a memorandum detailing the request of two companies to close a portion of Muir Road. These two companies, Natural Aggregates Corporation and Ashley Land Development Company, both own mining property along Muir Road between Buno and Stobart Roads. A third owner, Brighton Investors, LLC, concurs in the action. The pits located on the property are used for gravel extraction and processing and are largely played out. The two companies have proposed a joint reclamation plan. They propose to bear the cost of closing the road and removing the portion of Muir Road north of the old Holloway pit to Stobart Road.

Although the impact should be minimal, Mr. Wasylyk recommended a thorough review process that would include an analysis of the impacts on surrounding traffic flow and the concerns of neighboring residents. It would require working closely with Brighton Township to coordinate with their land use policies.

Staff informed the Board that this issue would be returned again for further consideration once the due diligence phase was complete.

G. INFORMATION ITEMS

The following items were presented to the board as information only:

1. Clip Sheets (February 9-15, 2012)
2. Clip Sheets (February 16-22, 2012)
3. Motor Fuel Taxes, Sales Tax on Motor Fuels, and Tax Collection
4. 2012-2013 Winter Season Salt Bid

H. CALL TO THE PUBLIC (2)

No Response

I. LEGAL

No Report

J. ADMINISTRATIVE BUSINESS

1. Minutes

**a. Regular Board Meeting
February 9, 2012**

The proposed minutes of the meeting of February 9, 2012, were presented to the Board for its review and approval.

ACTION: It was moved by Commissioner Peckens, seconded by Commissioner Dunleavy, to approve the meeting minutes of February 9, 2012.

Ayes: Commissioners Crane, Dunleavy, Peckens.

Nays: None.

Motion Carried.

2. Bills

ACTION: It was moved by Commissioner Peckens, seconded by Commissioner Dunleavy, to approve vouchers 071979 through 072055 in the net amount of \$131,538.59.

Ayes: Commissioners Crane, Dunleavy, Peckens.

Nays: None.

Motion Carried.

3. Meetings Announced

**a. Next Regular Board Meeting
Wednesday, March 7, 2012 - 9:30 a.m.**

4. Financial Reports Reviewed

a. Cash Position Statement

5. Miscellaneous Road Items

Mr. Craine indicated that Oceola Township has requested a project agreement for reconstruction and paving of Clyde Road between Mack Road and Argentine Road. This will complete the paving of Clyde Road that was originally set forth in a concept discussion several years ago. Mr. Craine said that he was impressed with Oceola's ability to manage its money in these economic times to undertake such an important project. He said that staff was in the process of finalizing the items for the bid proposal and is preparing applications for required permits.

Mr. Craine also provided the Board with an update on weight restrictions. He stated that staff at this time did not see a reason to impose weight limits on March 1. The temperature conditions had not been such that consideration of frost laws is necessary at this time. Staff will continue to monitor road conditions to determine if load restrictions will have to be imposed at a later date. The public will be advised by various media including radio, newspaper advertise, direct email from a frost law notification listserv, and by posting on the livingstonroads.org website.

K. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business to come before the Board, Chairman Crane declared the meeting adjourned at 10:40 a.m. Motion carried.

Signed _____
Stephen F. Crane, Chairman

Signed _____
Michael Craine, Managing Director